



**ERIE COUNTY WATER AUTHORITY**  
**INTEROFFICE MEMORANDUM**

April 8, 2019

To: Terrence D. McCracken, Secretary to the Authority

From: Russell J. Stoll, Executive Engineer

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "R. Stoll", is written over the name "Russell J. Stoll" in the "From:" line.

Subject: Request for Proposals  
Design and Construction for Raw Water Transmission Main,  
Van de Water Raw Water to Van de Water Treatment Plant.  
Routing Study for Delivered Water Transmission Main,  
Van de Water Treatment Plant to Ball Pump Station.  
ECWA Project No. 201900011

---

The Erie County Water Authority (ECWA) recently issued a Request for Proposal (RFP) to nine consulting engineering firms for professional engineering services for performing design of a second raw water transmission main at Van de Water. A second project was included in the RFP for a routing study for finished water transmission main between Van de Water and Ball Pump Station.

Currently there is a single transmission main between Van de Water Raw Water pump station and the Van de Water Treatment Plant. The addition of the second transmission main will increase the hydraulic capacity, but more importantly will improve system redundancy and resiliency.

The finished water transmission main between the Van de Water Treatment Plant and Ball Pump Station is twinned at some limited locations and drops down to a single line at other locations. The study will help determine what the best route will be for the completion of the second transmission main. This project will also improve hydraulic capacity and will improve system redundancy and resiliency.

The Request for Proposals was issued to the following professional engineering firms:

Arcadis  
Greenman-Pedersen, Inc.  
CHA Consulting, Inc.  
Erdman Anthony & Associates, Inc.  
Clark Patterson Lee  
GHD  
Nussbaumer & Clarke, Inc.  
Wendel Companies  
Wm. Schutt and Associates

Three of the above firms chose not to submit proposals on either project. Those firms include Clark Patterson Lee, Greenman-Pederson, Inc. and Wm. Schutt & Associates.

The proposals were reviewed and discussed among the engineering staff (Russ Stoll, Len Kowalski, and Steve Denzler). Experience, staffing, scope, and project approach were considered. It was determined that each firm possessed relevant qualifications to perform the work proposed.

Review of the six design and construction phase proposals for the raw water transmission main project included the following. Each firm provided a thorough and detailed technical project understanding and approach for both the proposed projects. In addition, their proposed project level of effort is competitive and reasonable for the work being proposed. They demonstrated knowledge and experience with ECWA standards, design procedures, construction standards and procedures, and technical specifications. In addition, the firms have experienced staff to provide the construction phase services and construction oversight required by the Authority. Our staff review also considered overall performance of professional services for these firms with recent experience with ECWA projects.

Nussbaumer & Clarke provided an experienced and qualified project team to perform the work related to transmission main between Van de Water Raw Water pump station and the Van de Water Treatment Plant. They had the best understanding of the proposed project elements. Their fee was competitive compared to the other firms.

Arcadis provided an experienced and qualified project team to perform a Study of the routing of the finished water transmission main from Van de Water Treatment Plant to Ball Pump Station. Their proposal provided the most detailed project understanding and approach, and scope of work for the study. They also provided a competitive professional fee.

I am requesting the Board's approval to negotiate with the above two firms Nussbaumer & Clarke and Arcadis to develop contracts for the referenced projects.

LFK:jmf

cc: R.Lichtenthal

P.Fabozzi

ECWA-731-1901